

STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION
Also Meeting As
STATE BOARD FOR VOCATIONAL EDUCATION

Ladislaus B. Dombrowski Board Room
John A. Hannah Building
608 West Allegan
Lansing, Michigan

February 18, 1999
8:30 a.m.

Present: Mr. Arthur E. Ellis, Chairman
Mrs. Dorothy Beardmore, President
Mrs. Kathleen N. Straus, Vice President
Dr. Herbert S. Moyer, Secretary
Mrs. Sharon A. Wise, Treasurer
Mrs. Sharon L. Gire, NASBE Delegate
Mr. Clark Durant
Mrs. Marianne Yared McGuire
Mrs. Eileen L. Weiser
Mr. Tim Kelly, representing Governor John Engler

I. CALL TO ORDER

Mr. Ellis called the meeting to order at 8:48 a.m.

II. AGENDA MATERIALS

- A. Revised pages 64 and 66 of the report titled, "Michigan's Charter School Initiative: From Theory to Practice"
- B. Revised Resolution Proclaiming March 1999 as Parenting Awareness Month
- C. Approval of Amendment to Northville Public Schools' Waiver Renewals - Memorandum dated February 18, 1999, from Mr. Ellis to the Board

III. INFORMATIONAL MATERIALS

- A. Notice of Intent to Apply for Federal Grant Award - Foreign Language Assistance Intensive Summer Institutes
- B. Notice of Intent to Apply for Federal Grant Award - 1999-2000 Emergency

Immigrant Education Program

- C. Information on 1998-99 Section 36 State Aid Grants for the Michigan School Readiness Program - Memorandum dated February 18, 1999, from Mr. Ellis to the Board
- D. Information on 1998-99 Section 36a Zero to Three Secondary Prevention Grants - Memorandum dated February 18, 1999, from Mr. Ellis to the Board
- E. Update on Activities at Michigan Schools of the Deaf and Blind (MSDB), the Michigan School for the Blind (MSB) Lansing Campus, Camp Tuhsmeheeta - Memorandum dated February 18, 1999, from Alexander G. Davlantes, Administrative Officer, to the Board
- F. Information on State Improvement Grant Award under the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act - Memorandum dated February 18, 1999, from Mr. Ellis to the Board
- G. Update on Federal Issues - Memorandum dated February 17, 1999, Mr. Ellis to the Board

IV. APPROVAL OF AGENDA AND ORDER OF PRIORITY

- A. Approval of Criteria for the 1999-2000 Federally Funded Child Care and Development Fund Competitive Grants for School-Age Child Care - added to agenda
- B. Approval of Criteria for the 1999-2000 Federally-Funded Child Care and Development Fund Competitive Grants for Three-Year Old Children - added to agenda
- C. Approval of Distribution of 1997-98 Unspent Funds Under Part C of the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act (IDEA) - added to agenda
- D. Approval of Fiscal Year 1998-99 Grants for Select Student Support Services (4-S), Michigan College/University Partnership (MICUP), and Morris Hood Jr. Educator Development (MHED) - added to agenda
- E. Approval of Traditional Calendar Waiver Application for School Improvement Purposes - added to agenda
- F. Adoption of Resolution Regarding Parenting Awareness Month - added to agenda

- G. Presentation of Single Record Student Database - added to agenda
- H. Approval of Amendment to Northville Public Schools' Waiver Renewals - added to agenda
- I. Approval of Amended FY 1997-98 Grant Awards for *Early On*® Michigan Under Part C of the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act - removed from agenda
- J. Receive the Report on the Status of Alternative Education - removed from agenda
- K. Interpretation of Policy Regarding the Certification Requirement for Teachers of Contracted Programs - removed from agenda

Mrs. Wise moved, seconded by Mrs. Beardmore, that the State Board of Education approve the agenda and order of priority, as modified.

Ayes: Beardmore, Durant, Gire, McGuire, Moyer, Straus, Weiser, Wise

The motion carried.

V. INTRODUCTION OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION AND GUESTS

Mrs. Eileen Hamilton, Administrative Secretary to the State Board of Education, introduced the members of the State Board of Education and guests attending the meeting.

VI. APPROVAL OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MINUTES/ACTIONS

- A. Approval of State Board of Education Minutes/Actions of Meeting of January 7, 1999

Dr. Moyer moved, seconded by Mrs. Wise, that the State Board of Education approve the minutes/actions of the State Board of Education meeting of January 7, 1999.

Ayes: Beardmore, Durant, Gire, McGuire, Moyer, Straus, Weiser, Wise

The motion carried.

VII. AWARDS AND RECOGNITIONS

- A. Presentation of Children's Health Award by Comprehensive School Health

Coordinator's Association

Mr. Don Sweeney, Coordinator of School Health Programs, Department of Community Health; and Ms. Martha Neilsen, Comprehensive School Health Coordinator, Eaton Intermediate School District, provided information regarding the Comprehensive School Health Coordinator's Association, and presented the Children's Health Award to Dr. Moyer.

Mr. Sweeney said nine state agencies, including the Michigan Department's of Education and Community Health, share responsibilities of implementation for the Michigan Model for Comprehensive School Health Education program. He said 115 voluntary and professional groups around the state implement school health programs in 92% of public and 240 private schools in Michigan, and 990,000 children and families are reached annually with basic health education messages. He said a network of 26 regional coordinators around the state are the trainers and administrators of the program, and have formed an association which presents an award annually to distinguished contributors in the area of school health.

Ms. Neilson said the Comprehensive School Health Coordinator's Association presents the Children's Health Award which has been designed to recognize significant and lasting contributions to the health of Michigan's school children through commitment and dedication. She said it is with great pleasure that the Comprehensive School Health Coordinator's Association recognizes Dr. Herbert S. Moyer as an individual whose contributions symbolize these qualities.

Ms. Neilson said Dr. Moyer has been an advocate for children and health education for many years as an educator, and a school administrator. She said as Superintendent of Bedford Public Schools, he was instrumental in helping develop the Michigan Model. She said he has been an advocate for children through his involvement with the Michigan Parent/Teachers Association, as a chairperson for state level committees, was Superintendent of the Year in 1994, and received the Michigan Education Association's Distinguished Service Award in 1997. She said the Comprehensive School Health Coordinator's Association is proud to recognize Dr. Moyer for his contributions to children and health in Michigan.

Dr. Moyer said he is honored by this award, and feels his contributions were minor in relationship to the efforts of the Comprehensive School Health Coordinator's Association and health education teachers across the state of Michigan. He said through perseverance and good communication in the

essence of the program, difficulties have been overcome, and it is a model exemplified across the nation in many respects. He gave heartfelt thanks to the Comprehensive School Health Coordinator's Association, and said he was pleased to accept the award.

VIII. CONSENT AGENDA

- A. Approval of the 1999-2000 Funding and Grant Criteria for Adult Basic Education Activities Under Sections 322 and 353 of the Adult Education Act
- B. Approval of Criteria for the 1999-2000 Michigan School Readiness Program Grants for Four-Year-Old Children At-Risk of School Failure
- C. Approval of Amended Criterion for the 1998-1999 Federally-Funded Child Care and Development Fund Grants for School-Age Child Care
- D. Approval of Criteria for the 1999-2000 Federally Funded Child Care and Development Fund Competitive Grants for School-Age Child Care
- E. Approval of Criteria for the 1999-2000 New and Continuation Even Start Grants
- F. Approval of Criteria for the 1999-2000 Federally-Funded Child Care and Development Fund Competitive Grants for Three-Year Old Children
- G. Approval of FY 1999 Off-Road Recreation Vehicle (ORV) Safety Education Grant Awards
- H. Approval of Distribution of 1997-98 Unspent Funds Under Part C of the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act (IDEA)
- I. Approval of Fiscal Year 1998-99 Grants for Select Student Support Services (4-S), Michigan College/University Partnership (MICUP), and Morris Hood Jr. Educator Development (MHED) Programs
- J. Receive the Report on Personnel Status
- K. Approval of 1997-98 Annual Performance Report for Vocational-Technical Education
- L. Approval of 1998-2001 Intermediate School District Plans and Approval of One Modification to a Previously Approved Intermediate School District Plan
- M. Approval of Recommendations Regarding Camp Tuhsmeheeta (removed from

consent agenda and placed under discussion items)

- N. Appointment of Members to the State Board for Public Community Colleges
- O. Approval of State Board of Education/Department of Education Cosponsorships
- BB. Approval of Traditional Calendar Waiver Application for School Improvement Purposes
- CC. Adoption of Resolution Regarding Parenting Awareness Month

Mrs. McGuire moved, seconded by Mrs. Gire, that the State Board of Education approve the Superintendent's recommendations for the items on the consent agenda as follows:

- A. approve the 1999-2000 funding and grant criteria for adult basic education activities under Sections 322 and 353 of the Adult Education Act, as described in the Superintendent's memorandum dated January 27, 1999;**
- B. approve the criteria for the 1999-2000 Michigan School Readiness Program Grants for Four-Year-Old Children At-Risk of School Failure, as presented in the Superintendent's memorandum dated January 27, 1999;**
- C. approve the amended criterion for the 1998-1999 Federally-Funded Child Care and Development Fund Grants for School-Age Child Care, as described in the Superintendent's memorandum dated January 27, 1999;**
- D. approve the criteria for the 1999-2000 Federally-Funded Child Care and Development Fund Competitive Grant Program for School-Age Child Care, as described in Attachment A of the Superintendent's memorandum dated January 27, 1999;**
- E. approve the criteria for the 1999-2000 new and continuation Even Start grants, as described in Attachment A of the Superintendent's memorandum dated January 27, 1999;**
- F. approve the criteria for the Federally-Funded 1999-2000 Child Care and Development Fund Competitive Grants for Three-Year-Old Children, as described in the Superintendent's memorandum dated January 27, 1999;**

- G. approve FY 1999 ORV Safety Education Grant Awards to the applicants listed in Exhibit B of the Superintendent's memorandum dated January 27, 1999;**
- H. approve the distribution of 1997-98 unspent funds under Part C of the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act (IDEA), as identified in Attachment A of the Superintendent's memorandum dated January 27, 1999;**
- I. approve the Fiscal Year 1998-99 Select Student Support Services (4-S), Michigan College/University Partnership (MICUP), and the Morris Hood, Jr., Educator Development (MHED) Programs, as contained in the memorandum from the Superintendent of Public Instruction dated February 10, 1999;**
- J. receive the report on personnel status, as described in the Superintendent's memorandum of February 12, 1999;**
- K. approve the 1997-98 Annual Performance Report Executive Summary (Attachment A) and the 1997-98 Annual Performance Report for Vocational-Technical Education, as described in the Superintendent's memorandum dated January 27, 1999, for transmittal to the U.S. Department of Education;**
- L. (1) approve the four intermediate school district Plans for the 1998-2001 school years, as identified in the Superintendent's memorandum dated January 27, 1999; and (2) approve one modification to a previously approved intermediate school district special education Plan, as identified in the Superintendent's memorandum dated January 27, 1999;**
- M. (this item was removed from the consent agenda, and placed under discussion items);**
- N. appoint to the State Board for Public Community Colleges: Mr. Lewis Driskell to fill a term ending January 31, 2007; and Ms. Carol S. Mack to fill a term ending January 31, 2007, as recommended in the Superintendent's memorandum dated January 27, 1999;**
- O. approve the cosponsorships of the conferences described in the exhibits to the Superintendent's memorandum dated January 27, 1999, as**

follows: (1) “First Annual ‘Hat’s Off’ Luncheon”; (2) “*Fourth Annual Prevention for Children and Families Conference: Strengthening Children, Families and Communities Through Assets and Protective Factors*”; and (3) “14th Annual Great Lakes Wellness Conference”;

- BB. approve the waiver application made by Essexville-Hampton Public Schools on behalf of the K-5 Verellen Elementary School, as outlined in the Superintendent’s memorandum of February 12, 1999; and**
- CC. adopt the resolution proclaiming March 1999 as Parenting Awareness Month, as attached to the Superintendent’s memorandum dated February 12, 1999.**

The vote was taken on the motion.

Ayes: Beardmore, Durant, Gire, McGuire, Moyer, Straus, Weiser, Wise

The motion carried.

The resolution is attached as Exhibit A.

IX. APPROVAL OF RECOMMENDATIONS REGARDING CAMP TUHSMEHETA

Mr. Ellis said the Michigan School for the Blind Trust Fund Committee has provided three recommendation regarding the camp program at Camp Tuhsmeheeta (Camp T). He said the recommendations focus on the summer 1999 camp program, renovations at Camp T, and the allocation of funds.

Mrs. Beardmore moved, seconded by Mrs. McGuire, that the State Board of Education recommend that (1) Camp Tuhsemeheta not operate during the summer of 1999; (2) renovation work at the camp be put on hold through the summer of 1999; and (3) allocated funds for summer 1999 be used to subsidize attendance of blind/visually impaired students at a wide range of summer activities available to blind and visually impaired children and youth, as recommended in the Superintendent’s memorandum dated February 10, 1999.

Mrs. Gire said Representative Doug Spade, who is blind and very interested in this issue, has contacted her and stated that he wished to obtain further information prior to Board action. She said she has spoken with members of the Board who have visited Camp T and have witnessed that repairs are needed before another season of camp, and she expressed concern that the renovations would not be completed before the summer of 2000. She said an effort should be made to obtain a broader impression on issues pertaining to Camp T and possibly include input from the Legislature, including Representative Spade.

Mrs. Beardmore said work that had been scheduled has not begun because the process involved with meeting code requirements is lengthier than expected. She said it is the belief of the Michigan School for the Blind Trust Fund Committee that because of safety issues students will not be able to attend Camp T during the summer of 1999, and that until a thorough study of the long term options can be explored, scheduled construction should be put on hold. She said several meetings were held with Opportunities Unlimited for the Blind to ensure safety for the students and establish an appropriate setting for them to attend camp.

Mrs. Beardmore said issues not related to construction continue to be discussed, and funds allocated but not used for renovations should be made available to provide other camp options to blind or visually impaired students. She said there are many camps in and out of state that accommodate visually impaired and blind children. She said it is understandable that Representative Spade would appreciate an opportunity for involvement, and although many people have provided input, she feels some populations have not been represented and their comments would be welcome.

Mrs. Wise said she feels it is important that parents and children know there are other options available, and that the Board will provide scholarships so that they have the opportunity to attend and experience camp.

Mrs. Beardmore said the Michigan School for the Blind Trust Fund Committee recommends that the information be disseminated by March 1999. She said many families and service providing groups are listed in the publication titled, "Camp-O-Rama," and while the list is a year old, comparable listings are developed each year and provided by the Physically Impaired Association of Michigan (PIAM). She said the publication lists a variety of camps, and the disabilities they are able to accommodate. She said it is her understanding that the NASA Camp in Alabama has facilities for the blind and visually impaired, and information on other programs out of state will hopefully be forthcoming. She said the Board believes that the best use of the available funds would be to provide scholarships for a large number of students who presently attend Camp T.

The following individuals offered comments on this item:

- Ms. Carol Duff, Michigan School for the Blind Alumni Association, P.O. Box 190, Sunfield, Michigan 48890.
- Mr. Rob Wing-Proctor, 16973 DeWitt Road., Lansing, Michigan 48906.
- Ms. Gwen Botting, Michigan Parents of the Visually Impaired, 4175 Westbrook Road, Ionia, Michigan 48846.

- Mr. Steve Handschu, Michigan Commission for the Blind, 5330 West Michigan Avenue, Apartment 302, Lansing, Michigan 48917.
- Mr. Kim Traverse, 1002 Coolidge, Kalamazoo, Michigan 49006.
- Mr. Robert J. Marko, 4210 Ingham Street, Lansing, Michigan 48911.
- Mr. Fred Wurtzel, National Federation of the Blind - Michigan, 1212 North Foster, Lansing, Michigan 48912.
- Ms. Mary Wurtzel, Opportunities Unlimited for the Blind, 1212 North Foster, Lansing, Michigan. 48912 Ms. Wurtzel provided a copy of an article titled, "Climbing the Ledges of Success," Grand Ledge Independent, 7/14/98 to the Board.
- Mr. Robert Houghtaling, Opportunities Unlimited for the Blind, 300 Carriage Way, Davison, Michigan 48423
- Ms. Lydia Schuck, 1981 Eden Road, Mason, Michigan 48854

The following documents were distributed to the Board: (1) memorandum dated February 17, 1999, from Mr. Earl Steenstra, Chairperson, Commission for the Blind, Family Independence Agency, to Mrs. Beardmore; (2) memorandum dated February 15, 1999, from Mr. Robert Essenberg, Treasurer, Opportunities Unlimited for the Blind, to the Board; and (3) "Camp-O-Rama," March 1998.

Mr. Ellis said renovations have not been canceled, but merely placed on hold. He said many federal and state laws have been enacted since Camp T's opening that determine how it is to function.

Mrs. Straus said the first time she visited the camp she was impressed by the accomplishments of the students, however, she was also concerned with its condition. She said she pushed to utilize the Trust Fund money to improve the camp, and bring it up to code to provide a productive environment for the people who wish to take advantage of its resources. She said she was under the impression that staff had been in contact with the Opportunities Unlimited of the Blind, and that they were aware of the cancellation of the agreement between the Department and the Opportunities Unlimited of the Blind.

Mrs. Straus suggested that the Board accept Mr. Handschu's offer to work with the Michigan Commission for the Blind and the Opportunities Unlimited for the Blind to attempt to resolve the problems that exist at the camp. She said the recommendation to close Camp T for the summer of 1999 was thought to be the most acceptable solution, however, perhaps other options could be explored.

Mrs. Gire said she would prefer an alternate recommendation that did not stipulate that the camp close for the summer of 1999. She said it is apparent that Camp T is in need of repair in order to bring it up to code and for safety purposes. She said decisions regarding the future of Camp T should be a separate issue and should involve a parent representative, as well as the Commission for the Blind. She said that would build a collaborative approach to serving children.

Mrs. Weiser said even with that element there has to be an effort to understand the essence of what the visually challenged people desire and have discussed. She said a politically correct, absolutely renovated, top notch facility does not get them where they want to go in terms of physical rehabilitation, offering an awareness of their surroundings, and the ability to overcome obstacles. She said the difficulty will be for the Board to try to figure out, with their assistance, what they want and need in Camp T versus what has been legislated.

Mr. Durant said he was not comfortable supporting a recommendation that prohibited the camp in opening in time for the summer 1999 season. He said clearly the camp is serving the needs of people right now, and it ought to be able to continue to do so.

Mrs. McGuire expressed concern regarding safety at Camp T. She said she recognizes that people enjoy the rustic atmosphere, however, she feels there is a fine line between rustic and unsafe. She said she feels the need to proceed with the recommendation, and thinks any delay prevents children or students from the opportunity to apply for scholarships and attend alternate camps.

Dr. Moyer said the Board should be conscious of safety issues at the camp, and feels it would be advantageous if renovations could be completed within a season. He said it sounds like the provisions that have been suggested in the recommendation are reasonable, but do not conform to the expectations of past participants relative to the advantages of Camp T. He said a conspiracy or plot to eliminate the camp is not apparent to him, but the proposed recommendation is an approach to rectify some issues.

Dr. Moyer said he is not familiar with the history of the camp nor why renovations have not been ongoing, especially considering that funds have been available. He said he feels a review is necessary to avoid a similar situation in the future where utilization of the camp must be eliminated for a full season. He said in the interest of the welfare, benefit, and ultimate survival of the camp, it is imperative to ensure that it is up to par to accommodate those who wish to participate in the program. Mr. Durant said he understands the concern regarding the future of the camp because another comment in the information folder states that the Department of Management and Budget has been asked to obtain a fair market value of the property, which indicates an intention to do something with the property.

Mr. Ellis said an appraisal is required by state law if the Board were to choose to offer Camp T to one of the blind organizations.

Mrs. Gire said it is evident that the Board is concerned with providing appropriate services to blind and visually impaired children outside the school setting, however, she feels that the issues surrounding Camp T should be separated from whether alternate camps and programs are available through the Board. She said a negative signal is given to the community and the state regarding the Board's intentions if the issues cannot be separated. She said the Board should do what needs to be done to insure the protection of the children through another summer camp cycle, and then determine if a change in direction is necessary for the future. She said the Commission of the Blind and parents should be invited to participate in the process.

Dr. Michael Williamson, Assistant Superintendent, said the original bids received for the renovation projects were substantially over the available appropriated funds. He said the Michigan School for the Blind Trust Fund Committee received the information and requested a solicitation for new bids, which arrived on January 20, 1999. He said the new bids are within the allotted appropriations. He said the Department of Management and Budget is awaiting direction from the Board before they proceed.

Dr. Williamson said a decision must be made whether the Board and the Department are prepared to continue to operate Camp T. He said a decision to continue oversight must entail plans to maintain the camp through the summer of 1999, and then determine the fiscal agent.

Mrs. Straus said the Board was responsible for the reopening of camp several years ago, and the utilization of the trust fund moneys for repairs. She said the Board has also been its advocate in trying to promote a safe and viable atmosphere for blind and visually impaired children.

Mrs. Beardmore withdrew her motion, Mrs. McGuire her support.

Mrs. Beardmore said she was impressed with the many references to Camp T being the only place to meet peers and learn certain skills rather than having to rely on special accommodations for the blind and visually impaired.

Dr. Williamson said he thinks the camp could operate within the construction schedule subject to finding a fiscal agent and hiring an appropriate camp manager.

Mrs. Gire moved, seconded by Mrs. Straus, that the State Board of Education request Department staff to (1) take necessary steps to begin renovations as soon as possible and, if needed, revisit the feasibility of opening Camp Tuhsmehta for the summer of 1999 at the March 18, 1999 meeting; (2) provide for alternatives if necessary for the summer of 1999; and (3) form task force of

individuals to make recommendations on how to best address the needs of blind and visually impaired children outside of the classroom at Camp Tuhsmeheeta.

Mrs. Gire asked that the task force include representation from the Commission for the Blind, at least one parent representative of the children who attend Camp T, and possibly others such as Representative Spade.

Dr. Moyer said the sighted community has become insensitive to the circumstances experienced by the blind and visually impaired. He said the message received has been that Camp T is predicated on the fact that it may have some safety hazards, but in experiencing camp, blind and visually impaired children must develop their own individual accommodations. He said by eliminating safety precautions, the Board in effect is removing some of the very circumstances that they might need in a way to acclimatize their sensitivity to be effective within the world in which they live.

The vote was taken on the motion.

Ayes: Beardmore, Durant, Gire, McGuire, Moyer, Straus, Weiser, Wise

The motion carried.

X. RECESS

The Board recessed at 10:54 a.m. and reconvened at 11:20 a.m.

XI. UPDATE OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION ACTION PLAN

Dr. Michael R. Williamson, Assistant Superintendent, provided information, a slide presentation, and responded to questions from the Board pertaining to the progress of the 1997-98 State Board of Education Action Plan. He said efforts within the Department are centered around elements of the action plan, which was a useful document for staff as they focused toward pupil achievement. He said he appreciated staff efforts and involvement in the process of documenting what had been accomplished. He said he wished to give special thanks to Ms. Nancy Mincemoyer, Acting Director, Organizational Development and Training, for compiling information and preparing the presentation.

Dr. Williamson said he thinks priorities are not just accomplishments in terms of tasks set forth, but the lessons learned within an organization and internalized as priorities are revised and revisited. He said lessons learned thus far include time spent focusing on purpose, and behavior so that programs supported within the agency concentrate on and relate to the primary purpose.

Mr. Ellis said he has been impressed with the ability of staff to continue to focus on the direction set forth by the Board.

Mrs. Beardmore said even though resources may be available, without focus, progress is very difficult. She said that is true for school buildings experiencing difficulties, as well as the Board and Department.

Mrs. Straus said efforts throughout the Department should continue to focus on raising student achievement, however, though the gap between the minority and majority has begun to close, the challenge will be to extend those efforts even further. She said she is pleased that staff has followed the Action Plan, and continues to strive for excellence.

Dr. Williamson said the Action Plan has been a process of the Board establishing direction and has proven to be a useful tool for staff. He said he has been in education in Michigan for 30 years, and he believes what staff are doing to serve schools today is at an all time high. He said the responsiveness to the needs of districts, to provide support and assistance to districts, and to help administrators, teachers, and parents in the community are truly exemplary to what government ought to be.

Dr. Moyer said the Report of Progress of the 1997-98 State Board of Education Action Plan shows significant improvement in the areas identified, however, much remains to be done. He said public education is in a continual process of improvement because of ongoing changes and challenges. He said student achievement and school accountability are primary goals and should receive continued attention from the Board and staff. He said on March 20, 1997, the State Board of Education adopted a resolution "Identifying Schools and Districts to Receive Special Assistance to Increase Student Achievement," and he feels that the Board should once again revisit the topic of emancipated schools. He said an accreditation process is in place to help districts experiencing difficulty with student achievement, and he recommends that the Board reiterate the legislation that deals with school improvement. He said the Department has the responsibility for the implementation of that legislation, and this report highlights that improvements have been made in many areas. He expressed concern over the proposed legislation that would dissolve Detroit Public Schools' Board of Education, and turn control over to the Mayor of the City of Detroit, and that perhaps the Board could help turn the Governor and Legislature away from a direction that could be extremely counter productive.

No action was taken on this item.

XII. DISCUSSION REGARDING STRATEGIC PLANNING

Mrs. Beardmore said as Dr. Moyer stated, public education is a continuing process. She said ideas have been mentioned by Board members and other individuals that could possibly receive support as part of a future action plan. She said Mr. Craig Ruff, President, Public Sector Consultants, Inc. has agreed to meet with the Board in March to participate in further discussion, and help fine tune the future direction of the State Board of Education.

Mrs. Beardmore said it would be appropriate to remove some items from the

1997-98 Action Plan because they have been accomplished, but there may be other items and proposals that work toward those same goals. She said her personal hope is that the Board may be able to place a greater emphasis on prevention and the earliest possible intervention without removing existing services.

A memorandum dated February 11, 1999, from Mr. Ruff, to Mr. Ellis was distributed to the Board.

Mrs. Straus moved, seconded by Mrs. Gire, that the State Board of Education support the concept of the proposal of allowing Public Sector Consultants, Inc. to assist the State Board of Education in defining its direction for the next two years.

The vote was taken on the motion.

Ayes: Beardmore, Durant, Gire, McGuire, Moyer, Straus, Weiser, Wise

The motion carried.

XIII. PRESENTATION OF SINGLE RECORD STUDENT DATABASE

Dr. Lucian Parshall, Acting Director, Data and Technology Services, provided information and a slide presentation, and responded to questions from the Board pertaining to the single record student database, which he said is a comprehensive information system to replace paper-based student collection methods. He said this system is designed to fulfill state and federal reporting requirements, pupil counts, and improve the accuracy of statewide data, particularly graduation and dropout data. He said it also includes the creation of a warehouse where large data sets will be accessible to school districts, policymakers, and researchers. He said when complete, the warehouse will contain single student and personnel records, teacher supply data, fiscal information, and performance data all within a relational model that is linked with the State of Michigan's Geographical Information System. He said it is believed that the Michigan Education Information System (MEIS) will serve the educational community well into the 21st Century.

No action was taken on this item.

XIV. RECESS

The Board recessed for lunch at 12:15 p.m. and reconvened at 1:15 p.m.

XV. PRESENTATION BY DETROIT PUBLIC SCHOOLS

Ms. Viola Walker, Chief Executive Assistant to the General Superintendent, Detroit Public Schools, provided information and responded to questions from the Board pertaining to the steps that have been taken toward reform in Detroit Public Schools.

She said Dr. Eddie Green, General Superintendent, Detroit Public Schools, has been diligent in ensuring he touches base with all groups that have a particular interest and impact on the school district. She said he regrets that he was unable to attend today's meeting, and has offered to address the Board at a later date. She said the administration of Detroit Public Schools have begun to realize that there are a lot of wonderful things going on in the school system, and that the district has been on a track of improvement, progress, reform, and reorganization. She said Dr. Green's goal has been to share this information with organizations, groups, and leaders in the state and the country.

Ms. Walker distributed a copy of "A Profile of Continuous Improvement in the Detroit Public Schools," and reviewed the document with the Board.

Ms. Walker said Detroit Public Schools have been described as failing academically and financially, however, by all current standards, it is not the worst school district in Michigan. She said an overwhelming majority of the school buildings in Detroit are very old. She said a \$1.5 billion bond issue was passed in 1994, however, it was not until 1996 that the state treasurer approved the plan to proceed with selling the bonds. She said over that two year span, the school district was at a great disadvantage because of the building problems, but did not have adequate funds to make repairs. She said once approval was received, the district proceeded with selling Series I bonds, and completed or committed to all of the projects in association to the bond program. She said Series II was approved in the fall of 1998, and changes to the facilities are now in process. She said some of the early decisions relating to the bond program did not allow it to move forward as fast as it should have. She said in 1997, the district hired an assistant superintendent with a background in implementing bond programs, and as a result more progress has been made than in prior years. She said the Detroit Board of Education passed a resolution to expedite bond issues as they arise.

Ms. Walker said the school district reorganized in 1998, which was a major undertaking because the area offices had become quite entrenched. She said there are now four management divisions responsible for overall district operations, community sources, finances, business operations, and educational services. She said each division has an associate superintendent who reports directly to the general superintendent. She said K-12 Learner Centered Constellations were organized which encompass merchants, libraries, neighborhoods, high schools, middle schools, and elementary schools within a specified geographic area. She said a minimum of four times a year principals, teachers, and parent representatives are required to meet regarding a continuity of instruction for all students and must prepare a constellation improvement plan which links each one of the individual school building improvement plans.

Ms. Walker said site based management was launched in the 1998-99 school year, and each school building has a decision making representative council of constituent groups consisting of teachers, parents, stakeholders, and administrators. She said the council reviews personnel choices, budgets, and instructional decisions. She said

many building principals and council members required additional training to learn how to deal with the greater level of decision making, the new process, and conflict resolution. She said a national consultant was hired and the training televised to allow parents the opportunity to understand the process of site based management. She said principals report directly to the Superintendent, which eliminates the many layers that were present in the old system, and allows principals and parents direct access to the Superintendent.

Ms. Walker said with an unbalanced budget and a \$20 million deficit, Detroit Public Schools could have been described in 1995 as being in a financial crisis. She said the district underwent several cost cutting measures across the board, and has maintained a balanced budget for the last three years. She said at the end of the 1997-98 school year, Detroit Public Schools had a \$93 million surplus, part of which will go into a rainy day fund. She said this has enabled the school district to refute the issue that it is a financially irresponsible district, and has demonstrated fiscal responsibility, capacity, and the ability to take care of financial issues.

Ms. Walker said students in Detroit Public Schools face an overwhelming number of barriers on a daily basis which may affect completion of a high school diploma. She said many of them must work, become incarcerated, move out of the district, or are institutionalized. She said the school district enacted the 9th Grade Restructuring Program which provides special resources and funds for all high schools and allows for an additional assistant principal to work exclusively with 9th graders. She said the program will show its results for the 1999 graduates, but for the last four years 9th graders coming into the district have received a series of services, activities, programs, counseling, social workers and the assistant principal. She said many students return after dropping out of school to complete their high school education and receive a diploma. She said unfortunately the state does not consider the data for students who take longer than four years to graduate.

Ms. Walker said the Exit Skills Program is one area Detroit Public Schools has led the state and nation to insure that a student has the necessary information to achieve success before advancing to the next grade level. She said the program is currently in operation for grades K-5 and will extend to the middle grades in 1999, and the high school level in 2000. She said the Exit Skills Program eliminates social promotion and provides support through mandatory summer school. She said it is believed that the program will have impact on the academic achievement of students and the graduation rates.

Ms. Walker said a National Science Foundation grant allowed the school district to provide substantial support, training, and technical assistance to unaccredited and low performing schools. She said with assistance from the Achievement Group and the Department, each school in Detroit is now either interim or summary accredited.

Ms. Walker said she feels that substantial progress in all areas has been made by Detroit Public Schools, and it is important to receive recognition and support from the State Board of Education.

In response to Mrs. Gire, Ms. Walker said a student who does not pass an Exit Skills test is required to attend summer school. She said of the approximately 7,000 Kindergarten through 2nd grade students who have been required to attend summer school, only 7% were retained.

In response to Mrs. Straus, Ms. Walker said initially, the Achievement Group worked primarily with unaccredited schools, however, they have expanded to strengthen borderline schools as well. She said the schools which received assistance have all improved.

Mrs. Straus said she is pleased that Detroit has accomplished that goal because the Board has focused much attention on raising student achievement and closing the gap between minority and majority students.

Dr. Moyer said students who drop out of school but return through adult education or the General Educational Development (GED) program to acquire a diploma are an important population. He said the Sandia Laboratories conducted a study for the Department of Energy several years ago and concluded that those students should be counted in the graduation data, and included them in the calculation of a national graduation rate. He said Michigan's rate was lifted to the 90th percentile.

In response to Mr. Durant, Ms. Walker said she thinks Detroit Public Schools need to strengthen as a district, in terms of the facilities and management. She said there are areas in operations that will now be able to get a different level of attention and show substantial improvement.

Mrs. Beardmore said she believes that students should not count as dropouts until they are at least 22 years old. She said a presentation earlier in the meeting regarding the Single Record Student Database would make it possible to remain aware of where a given child is by a coded system. She said it would then be possible to know if a student had successfully reached a good standard a year early, and graduated at three and half years, and therefore was not around at four years to be counted as a graduate. She said it would also enable the mobility issue to be tracked more easily.

In response to Mrs. McGuire, Ms. Walker said the 1998-99 school year began with four major initiatives that encompass what is happening in the district. She said the structure of the K-12 Constellation needs to become an integral part of the Detroit community. She said school district administrators would prefer to see the community agencies and parents embrace the program and work with the schools because it is going to be a major issue. She said the schools cannot do it alone. She said Dr. Green has launched resource coordinating teams to assist students facing crises and provide immediate intervention, and counseling. She said this program also requires the support of the community agencies. She said the greatest challenge is embracing the initiatives and the involvement of the community and parents because everything has a cause and effect and is connected.

Mrs. Gire said she feels there is a lack of objective targeting associated with the proposal. She said schools that could be described as lower achieving, even after becoming accredited, should receive additional attention. She said accreditation must expand beyond just helping unaccredited schools, and she expressed concern that the Board and the Department are focusing on one district, when many are in need of assistance. She said she thinks the Department is on the right track in trying to build a strong base to help lower achieving schools, however, she feels a less adversarial role is needed for a problem solving and collaborative relationship.

Mrs. Beardmore said many people share Mrs. Gire's concerns and question why Detroit Public Schools are being targeted, however, she feels it is simply a matter of size. She said Detroit boasts of 180,000 students, while the second largest school district in the state has only 30,000. She said the plans that Dr. Green and others have created and are implementing present a framework for improvement. She said the legislative issue right now is whether to wait for results or whether to jump start reform.

Dr. Moyer commended Detroit Public Schools for their cooperation with the Department on the accreditation process and in reducing the number of unaccredited schools. He said it is the purpose of the Department and the Legislature to identify those schools and go in with support teams on a cooperative, collaborative basis to bring about improvement. He said it is true that Detroit Public Schools is not the only district the Department has helped, and success has been evident throughout the state.

Mrs. Straus thanked Ms. Walker for sharing her perspective on Detroit Public Schools with the Board. She said even though she has been critical of Detroit Public Schools in the past, she thinks the proposed legislation is the wrong approach. She said cooperation and collaboration between the schools and the cities in which they exist are needed to bring all the resources to bear to make the schools and the cities successful. She said recommendations made by Mr. Bill Beckham, New Detroit, Inc., at the December 3, 1998 Board meeting are now in the process of being implemented, and is the kind of systemic reform that needs to be encouraged. She said she feels that Dr. Green should be given a chance to show that all the changes he has made are going to work rather than setting aside an elected school board. She said the proposed legislation focuses on the governance, but does not list criteria as to why one district is being targeted. She said she thinks Detroit is now on the right track for the first time in a long time and should be given a chance to implement the planned changes.

No action was taken on this item.

XVI. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IN STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING

- A. Mr. Justin King, Executive Director, Michigan Association of School Boards, 1001 Centennial Way, Suite 400, Lansing, Michigan 48917. Mr. King offered comments regarding the proposed takeover of Detroit Public

Schools.

- B. Ms. Mary Bridget Monaghan, 3333 Moores River Drive, Lansing, Michigan 48911. Ms. Monaghan offered comments regarding the State Board of Education promoting more panel discussions and debates of current educational hot-topics, and distributed a copy of a poem titled, "Pretty Good," by Mr. Charles Osgood.

XVI. PERSONAL PRIVILEGE - MR. CLARK DURANT

Mr. Durant said there is a widely held concern that Detroit Public Schools are the focus of proposed legislation. He said in an effort to help facilitate change and encourage reform, he recommends that the Board commit the next year to travel from either school to school or area to area in an effort to determine in depth some of the problems and offer its collective and singular influences to help the principals, teachers, and students do better academically. He said it is not enough to simply receive comments on the condition of the schools, but there is no greater problem confronting the Board than whether or not students in Detroit will be prepared to face challenges.

Mrs. Beardmore said Mr. Durant reflects a frustration and concern that she feels each Board member has, however, when asked how the Board could assist Detroit Public Schools, Mr. Bill Beckham, New Detroit, Inc. stated at the December 3, 1998 meeting that the district prefers to solve the problem itself. She said much has happened since then, and the Board is willing to assist in a problem solving capacity if necessary, and volunteer its services such as they are to not only help implement but expedite the process because the need is enormous.

Dr. Moyer said comments received regarding the September 3, 1998 Board meeting held in Detroit indicate that there should be an ongoing dialogue between the Board and Detroit Public Schools. He said it was a very enlightening meeting and brought a grassroots perspective to the issues.

XVII. REPORT OF HEARING OFFICER

- A. Property Transfer Case C-2588 - David and Charlene Yonker and John and Donna Cornell

Mr. Ellis said Property Transfer Case C-2588 involves a request to transfer property from the White Cloud Public Schools to the Morley-Stanwood Community Schools. He said the Hearing Officer recommends that the property be transferred.

Mrs. Beardmore moved, seconded by Mrs. Wise, that the State Board of Education adopt, as its own, the written decision and order and authorize the Superintendent of Public Instruction to issue Property

Transfer Case C-2588, David and Charlene Yonker and John and Donna Cornell, Appellants v White Cloud Public Schools and Morley-Stanwood Community Schools, Appellees, as attached to the Superintendent's memorandum dated January 27, 1999, granting appellants' petition to transfer property from the White Cloud Public Schools to the Morley-Stanwood Community Schools.

The vote was taken on the motion.

**Ayes: Beardmore, Gire, McGuire, Moyer, Straus, Weiser, Wise
Absent during vote: Durant**

The motion carried.

B. Property Transfer Case C-2590 - Darrell and Kimberly Cowen

Mr. Ellis said Property Transfer Case C-2590 involves a request to transfer property from the Bentley Community Schools to the Davidson Community Schools. He said the Hearing Officer recommends that the property transfer request be denied.

Mrs. Straus moved, seconded by Mrs. McGuire, that the State Board of Education adopt, as its own, the written decision and order and authorize the Superintendent of Public Instruction to issue Property Transfer Case C-2590, Darrell and Kimberly Cowan, Appellants v Bentley Community Schools and Davison Community Schools, Appellees, as attached to the Superintendent's memorandum dated January 27, 1999, denying appellants' petition to transfer property from the Bentley Community Schools to the Davison Community Schools.

The vote was taken on the motion.

**Ayes: Beardmore, Gire, McGuire, Moyer, Straus, Weiser, Wise
Absent during vote: Durant**

The motion carried.

XVIII. TEACHER CERTIFICATION REVOCATION CASE - CHRISTINE DALLOS, TCR 98-2

Mr. Ellis said the Board has been provided with the record filed in Teacher Certification Revocation Case TCR 98-2. He said the Hearing Officer recommends that the teaching certificate of Christine M. Dallos be revoked.

Mrs. McGuire moved, seconded by Mrs. Straus, that the State Board of Education adopt, as its own, the written Decision and Order on Exceptions, authorize the Superintendent of Public Instruction to issue the Teacher Certification Revocation Case TCR 98-2, in Re: Christine M. Dallos.

The vote was taken on the motion.

**Ayes: Beardmore, Gire, McGuire, Moyer, Straus, Weiser, Wise
Absent during vote: Durant**

The motion carried.

XIX. RECEIVE THE REPORT ON ANNUAL ACTIVITIES OF THE PROFESSIONAL STANDARDS COMMISSION FOR TEACHERS

Mrs. Beardmore said that at the November 5, 1998 meeting, it was suggested that the Board try to find some way for legislative financial support for pedagogy assessment, and share it with institutions of teacher preparation. She said this item was presented for Board approval at the January 7, 1999 meeting. However, she requested that it be removed from the consent agenda because it was not stated that staff would proceed with the November request. She said staff unavailability prevented action in January.

Mrs. Beardmore moved, seconded by Mrs. Gire, that the State Board of Education receive the report on the annual activities of the Professional Standards Commission for Teachers for 1997-98, as described in the Superintendent's memorandum dated January 27, 1999.

The vote was taken on the motion.

**Ayes: Beardmore, Gire, McGuire, Moyer, Straus, Weiser, Wise
Absent during vote: Durant**

The motion carried.

XX. APPROVAL OF PROPOSAL FROM HOPE COLLEGE FOR AN AMENDMENT OF ITS LANGUAGE ARTS PROGRAM AS A GROUP MINOR AT THE SECONDARY LEVEL

Mrs. Beardmore expressed concern that the item did not mention proper grammar usage as part of its course work. She said Dr. Ed Blews, President, Association of Independent Colleges and Universities of Michigan, has verified that Hope College

does have a very strong component in teaching grammatical and basic skills.

Mrs. Beardmore moved, seconded by Mrs. Wise, that the State Board of Education approve the proposal for an amendment of the Language Arts program as a group minor at the secondary level as submitted by Hope College, as discussed in the Superintendent's memorandum dated January 27, 1999.

Dr. Ghada Khoury, Higher Education Consultant, Office of Professional Preparation, said the proposed amendment of the Language Arts Program is offered exclusively to English majors who intend to become teachers.

The vote was taken on the motion.

**Ayes: Beardmore, Gire, McGuire, Moyer, Straus, Weiser, Wise
Absent during vote: Durant**

The motion carried.

XXI. APPROVAL OF RECOMMENDATIONS REGARDING ADMINISTRATIVE
RULE WAIVERS; APPROVAL OF AMENDMENT TO NORTHVILLE PUBLIC
SCHOOLS' WAIVER RENEWALS

Dr. Michael Williamson, Assistant Superintendent, provided information and responded to questions from the Board pertaining to the recommendations regarding administrative rule waivers. He said a majority of the waivers presented are very similar to those approved by the Board at previous meetings, however, Waiver #0564-99-OSE/EIS requests to waive the requirement for a teaching certificate for a speech pathologist, which the Board has not historically supported. He said the difference with this particular waiver is it allows a speech pathologist to provide services normally performed by speech teachers. He said these are therapeutic services and are non-instructional. He said Waivers #0368/R-97-OSES and #0369/R-97-OSES have appeared before the Board at prior meetings. However, because of parent protest regarding the length of the day during the summer program, the waiver has been re-worded.

In response to Mrs. Straus, Mr. David Brock, Acting Supervisor, Policy, Planning, and Compliance, said he is not aware that the Professional Standards Commission is reviewing the issue of speech pathologist and certification.

The following individuals offered comments on this item.

- Mr. Robert Ferguson, Michigan Association of Administrators of Special Education, 13565 Port Sheldon Road, Holland, Michigan 49423.

- Dr. Renny Tatchell, Professor, Department of Communication Disorders, Central Michigan University, 904 Glen Avenue, Mount Pleasant, Michigan 48858.
- Ms. Nickola Nelson, Michigan Speech-Language-Hearing Association, Western Michigan University, Kalamazoo, Michigan 49008-5134.
- Mr. Ken Zimmerman, Coordinator, Planning and Monitoring/Manager, Montcalm Area Intermediate School District, 621 New Street, Post Office Box 367, Stanton, Michigan 48888-0367.

The following individuals joined Mr. Zimmerman at the table, but did not offer comments: Mr. Jim Pepma, 1207 Tyler, Greenville, Michigan 48848; Ms. Cheri Krogman, Greenville Public Schools, 5499 North Black Road, Coral, Michigan 49322; Ms. Tamara Youmans, Montcalm Area Intermediate School District, 301 Orange Street, #6, Greenville, Michigan 48838; Ms. Linda Van Houten, Greenville Public Schools, 10304 Leland Drive, Greenville, Michigan 48838; Ms. Cheryl Jones, 3940 South Staines Road, Sheridan, Michigan 48884; and Mr. Robert D. Moore, 18985 West Coral Road, Howard City, Michigan 49329.

Mrs. Straus moved, seconded by Mrs. Wise, that the State Board of Education (1) approve the Superintendent's recommendations regarding administrative rule waivers submitted by St. Clair Intermediate School District and Montcalm Area Intermediate School District, described in Attachment A to the Superintendent's memorandum dated February 3, 1999, and (2) approve the amendment to Northville Public Schools' waivers #0368/R-97-OSES and #0369/R-97-OSES.

The vote was taken on the motion.

Ayes: Beardmore, Durant, Gire, McGuire, Moyer, Straus, Weiser, Wise

The motion carried.

A copy of a memorandum dated February 18, 1998, from Mrs. Beardmore to the Board regarding Approval of Recommendations Regarding Administrative Rule Waivers was distributed to the Board.

Mrs. Beardmore said she would like to request that staff investigate ways in which personnel with a Master's degree could access an alternative route to teacher certification and/or be allowed to perform speech and language therapy services in schools without having to work toward teacher certification.

There was consensus to allow staff to complete this task and report back to the

Board at a later date.

XXII. DISCUSSION ON REPORT REGARDING PUBLIC SCHOOL ACADEMIES

Mr. Ellis said Mr. Donald Weatherspoon, Special Assistant for Institutional Education, has been asked to serve as liaison to coordinate the activities relating to the three documents pertaining to charter schools: (1) "The 1996-97 Report to the House and Senate Committees on Education: *A Description of Michigan Public School Academies (Charter Schools)*," which was prepared by staff as required by the Legislature; (2) "Evaluation of the Michigan Public School Academy Initiative," prepared by The Evaluation Center, Western Michigan University; and (3) "Michigan's Charter School Initiative: From Theory to Practice," prepared by Public Sector Consultants, Inc.

Mr. Weatherspoon introduced Mr. Nick Khouri, Vice President, Public Sector Consultants, Inc.; Mr. Bob Kleine, Senior Economist, Public Sector Consultants, Inc.; Dr. Jerry Horn, Principal Research Associate, The Evaluation Center, Western Michigan University; and Mr. Gary Miron, Principal Research Associate, The Evaluation Center, Western Michigan University. He said one of the requirements of the evaluation process was that the state should be divided, and therefore, Public Sector Consultants, Inc., handled the eastern half of the state, and Western Michigan University the western half, and the upper peninsula.

Dr. Horn said over the past year he and Mr. Miron encountered other individuals engaged in studies of charter schools. He said they tried to assure schools that they were one of the two studies that had been commissioned by the state, and received full cooperation from the schools. He said he was surprised by the strength of the charter school movement. He said charter schools fall in the area of trying to improve the educational opportunities for students, parental choice, and to provide an opportunity for teachers to obtain some professional development that may not be available to them in other settings.

Dr. Horn said the charter school movement in Michigan is one of the largest and is drawing national attention. He said there is much diversity in the schools, and even though management companies are becoming more and more prevalent and charter schools are similar in the way they operate, no two are exactly alike. He said it was found that the very first schools to receive authorization were started by people with extreme interest in creating a school in their community or even possibly for their own children. He said there was a lot of commitment from those founders, and the teachers were very dedicated, often working for a lower salary than in traditional schools. He said either teachers will continue to work for the lower rate or turnovers will be high disrupting the stability of the schools.

Dr. Horn said it was disappointing to find that there was not a great deal of

innovative curricula, and it was decided that it was necessary to determine a definition. He said many of the schools will say they are innovative, however, people who have been in education many years will recognize those programs and know that they are not new.

Dr. Horn said there are a number of eligible parties who could serve as authorizers, but for a variety of reasons, choose not to. He said some of the universities cite that it is not a major part of their mission to manage schools, or that they simply choose to not engage in the charter school arena because of potential conflict or losing cooperation from school districts in which they work. He said the authorizers tended to reveal or concede some of the weaknesses of the schools and responded by saying that part of the charter school movement was that this is a competitive society and if the school succeeds, parents will let their children attend. He said if the school is not good, it will eventually close.

Dr. Horn said the number of schools utilizing management companies which emphasize procedural guidelines is steadily increasing. He said authorizers, at the same time, generally acclaim the value of this because they are able to operate in a more efficient manner. He said many schools had early problems forming a functional board, which were appointed as opposed to being elected as in traditional public schools. He said many of the people appointed to the boards had no experience in that role, nor did they have any idea of the mission of the school. He said many of the founders had a commitment to the school and what its role should be, however, they tended to have some difficulty in releasing that function to the board. He said this has resulted in turnover in some of the schools and caused instability. He said regardless of the early difficulties, many of those schools have found a workable medium and are doing quite well.

Dr. Horn said he feels it is too early to judge the schools based on the Michigan Educational Assessment Program (MEAP). He said some of them have only been in existence one or two years. He said over time the MEAP could be a good assessment tool, but there are probably other measures of achievement which should be considered because of the uniqueness of charter schools.

Dr. Horn said in some cases, there seems to be a large number of minority students in the charter schools, however, at the same time, the proportion of non-minorities is increasing. He said it may be that new schools are being located in areas that minorities might not find accessible.

Dr. Horn said he encourages the Board to read the document carefully, and consider it as a base line for information.

Mr. Khouri said he appreciated the opportunity to undertake this project, and feels that many of the conclusions reached by Western Michigan University are similar to those reached by Public Sector Consultants, Inc. He said he would characterize the

evaluation by Public Sector Consultants, Inc. as positive, and he was impressed with the progress in the first four years of the schools' existence. He said he was surprised at the variety of charter schools, however, that also made it difficult for evaluators because examples could be found to contradict almost any general statement made. He said it was hard to characterize charter schools as a whole, and his basic conclusion is that because of their newness, the evaluations should be viewed as a baseline. He said he feels the state should continue a more rigorous evaluation. He said it was the general conclusion of Public Sector Consultants, Inc., that on the average, charter schools seem to have a greater rate of progress on the MEAP tests than comparable traditional schools. He said he concedes though that it is too early to tell with the methodology available.

Mrs. Beardmore said she was pleased that the Legislature requested this evaluation of charter schools because she feels that it was essential, and she agrees that the evaluation should continue. She said she is concerned with the utilization of management companies because, although they seem to solve many business problems, it simply circumvents the intent of the Legislature, which was to create relatively small, site based, and innovative schools that would provide opportunities to parents and students. She said she realizes that the management companies help with the early funding problems and the paper work, but it seems that they also change the entire complexion of charter schools.

Mrs. Beardmore said she seems to remember that in the first few years charter schools were in existence, federal moneys and Board approved funds were made available for start up costs. She said there was a suggestion in one of the reports that there should be further assistance from the state, but that has already been done.

Mrs. Beardmore said when Oakland University began authorizing charter schools, in addition to the requirements of the law, they requested that each school develop a business plan. She said many of the small "mom and pop" schools did not realize the complexity of running a school, and as a result of the business plan requirement people have learned, and many of the chartering institutions are now asking for more than the law requires.

Mrs. Beardmore said she feels the Board should expect local school districts to provide the same oversight of their schools as is expected of charter schools. She said it would focus more attention on a particularly weak school in a strong school system.

In response to Mrs. McGuire, Mr. Khouri said the diversity of charter schools was mainly by profile, and not by ethnicity. He said in terms of facility size, mission of curriculum, instructional method, and approaches to running the business, the diversity of the charter schools was wide ranged and not isolated to any particular type of school.

Mr. Horn said he believes that many of the charter schools are very similar to traditional schools in terms of diversity.

Mr. Miron said some schools had an over proportionate number of students with special needs while others did not.

In response to Dr. Moyer, Dr. Horn said one of the legislative requirements was indeed a philosophy statement, which in most cases focused on the students. He said schools were provided with a self evaluation kit to encourage them to continually evaluate their school and determine if they are meeting their own mission. He said he feels that many are experiencing growth and understanding, although some stated that they are just trying to survive and were not prepared for the demands of running a school.

In response to Dr. Moyer, Mr. Miron said allegations have been made at two charter schools regarding the issue of separation of church and state. He said students were asked if they felt they were attending a religious school, and many of them said they felt they were. He said administrators and board members denied the allegations.

Mr. Khouri said in some cases the pastor was the organizer of the school and is on the board, which is legal. He said he and Mr. Kleine were unable to determine if there was a conflict within the school regarding the separation of church and state.

Mr. Miron said he saw no evidence of the curriculum being religious in nature.

In response to Mrs. Straus, Mr. Miron said some of the schools have a mission to attract students of a particular ethnic background, for instance schools with African American centered curriculum. He said many schools attract a certain type of student simply by their profile and mission.

Mrs. Straus said that she was quite concerned that students may become separated by ethnic background and the mission of some charter schools is to target specific ethnic groups. She said traditional public schools are an opportunity for many different cultures to intermingle and become American.

Mr. Kleine said the authorizer should monitor the schools in how they advertise and conduct their lotteries. He said he does not have a problem with schools attracting a certain type of student, however, the authorizers should be very conscientious of that when they consider a proposal.

Mr. Miron said Western Michigan University's recommendations state the need for safeguards against segregation by race, class, or disabilities.

Mr. Kleine said he agrees with Mr. Miron and feels it is a concern. He said much of

the issue comes from the location and focus of the schools.

In response to Mrs. Gire, Mr. Kleine said because the data are not currently available, it is not possible to go into specifics regarding students who transfer from a charter school to a traditional public school after head counts are taken.

Mr. Khouri said he believes it will be a research project in and of itself to study the impact of students transferring from charter schools to traditional public schools and vice versa.

Mr. Ellis said he feels that the Board and the Department will benefit by extending the contract for Western Michigan University and Public Sector Consultants, Inc. so they may continue the study of charter schools, and respond further to some of the questions raised by the Board.

Mrs. Gire expressed concern that even though it is evident some charter schools serve special needs children, others give an indication that they are incapable of doing so, and may give parents that message in an overt manner to discourage them from applying.

Mr. Miron said many charter schools have very good special education facilities and have even stated that they have received too many referrals, however, the opposite has been also been observed. He said information has been received that suggested parents have been counseled down. He said data are available that indicate there are many charter schools which have either very few or no special needs students.

Mr. Khouri said charter schools in the eastern portion of the state received substantially fewer special education revenues than the statewide average, which indicates that they are in fact educating special education students. He said some administrators stated that when many parents who had children identified as special education were considering charter schools, they requested that the student's portfolio not follow them to the charter school. He said they were looking for a fresh start.

Mr. Ellis said many parents, especially in southeastern Michigan, are transferring their children from traditional public schools to charter schools to escape from the special education classification.

Mr. Miron said several of the field assistants attended charter school board meetings and have reported that many of authorizing agencies require training for administrators and board members. He said the boards play a very important role for the students, but are still in the learning process. He said the boards operate better when parents are involved, and quite often professionals are asked to speak because of the experiences they can offer.

Mr. Khouri said administrators and staff have been solicited regarding boards, however, Public Sector Consultants, Inc. have not visited an actual meeting. He said many schools had difficulty in recruiting board members who in many instances assumed a limited role in the operation of the school. He said the question should be raised and explored on who exactly is responsible for charter schools, and what role does each entity play. He said he is not sure the authorizers have been sufficiently involved in their oversight role.

Mr. Miron said one of the larger management companies that establishes schools is involved in the recommendation of board members. He said it would be a curious situation if the charter school would decide to break their contract with the management company because they are the governing authority. He said boards recommended by management companies tend to have fewer conflicts of interest, and more cohesion.

Mrs. Straus said originally charter schools were began by people interested in starting a school. She said it has now become a business for management companies who seek out people willing to open a school in a new city. She said it is very different from the original intent of the law, which was to help people create innovative approaches and to be more involved.

Mr. Khouri said there is a wide variety of management companies. He said some may offer a curriculum and essentially run the school, while others simply provide supplies. He said in some instances they are full service management companies which take a struggling school that would not survive and keep it open, essentially taking it over. He said the existence of management companies means there are more charter schools in existence than there would be otherwise, so in some sense they are increasing innovation. He said perhaps it is a method that works and should be used in as many sites as possible.

Mrs. Straus said management companies are, in essence, creating their own bureaucracy parallel to the school district.

In response to Mrs. Straus, Mr. Khouri said there were a few recommendations in the report for changes in legislation. He said there are issues that need clarifying on whether charter schools should be able to borrow long time debt and what happens to the assets and liabilities when or if a school goes out of business or bankrupt.

Mr. Kleine said it has been evident that public schools have become more competitive, which weighs heavily on some communities. He said if a charter school opens in a small community, it has a large impact on schools in the way they operate and the way they deal with their parent contact.

Mrs. Beardmore expressed concern that profits are being made from charter schools which are funded with public moneys. She said when a charter school is created, a

choice is made regarding the grade level that will be made available. She said elementary schools are historically more economical to run than either middle or high schools, yet receive the same amount per student. She said she would prefer that the Board make a recommendation or present safeguards to the Legislature to enact into law that would prevent this from happening.

Mrs. Wise moved, seconded by Mrs. McGuire, that the State Board of Education receive the Report to the House and Senate Committees on Education: A Description of Michigan Public School Academies (Charter Schools), as discussed in the Superintendent's memorandum dated January 27, 1999.

The following individuals offered comments on this item.

- Mr. Robert Hollingsworth, 2717 Stoneleigh, Lansing, Michigan 48910.
- Mr. Tony Derezinski, Michigan Association of School Boards, 1001 Centennial Way, Lansing, Michigan 48917.
- Ms. Valerie Von Frank, The Leona Group, L. L. C., 4660 South Hagadorn Road, Suite 500, East Lansing, Michigan 48823-5353. Ms. Von Frank distributed a packet of information to the Board which contained copies of the following: news release from The Leona Group, L. L. C. titled, "Same study, different conclusion: Charter schools show positive effect on education"; Leona Links, "Smallness is key in 'scrappy upstart' successes"; Leona Links, "Study provides early snapshot of nation's growing charter school movement"; several essays written by students who attend various charter schools; Massachusetts Charter School Profiles, "Executive Summary 1995-96 School Year Pioneer Institute for Public Policy Research, Boston, MA"; an article from the Wall Street Journal, February 12, 1999, "Learning Curve, Charter Schools Begin to Prod Public Schools Toward Competition"; "News on charter schools," May 26, 1996; Massachusetts Department of Education, "Test Results from Massachusetts Charter Schools"; "Learning from the Past: Directions for the Future, Public Attitudes Toward Education in America"; and "A National Study of Charter Schools," U.S. Department of Education, Office of Educational Research and Improvement.

Mrs. Straus requested that staff prepare a report regarding charter schools and the support that is offered through the Department, and present it to the Board at a future meeting.

The vote was taken on the motion.

Ayes: Beardmore, Gire, McGuire, Straus, Weiser, Wise
Absent: Durant, Moyer

The motion carried.

XXIII. APPROVAL OF AMENDED FY 1997-98 GRANT AWARDS FOR *EARLY ON*® MICHIGAN UNDER PART C OF THE INDIVIDUALS WITH DISABILITIES EDUCATION ACT

This item was removed from the agenda.

XXIV. RECEIVE THE REPORT ON THE STATUS OF ALTERNATIVE EDUCATION

This item was removed from the agenda.

XXV. INTERPRETATION OF POLICY REGARDING THE CERTIFICATION REQUIREMENT FOR TEACHERS OF CONTRACTED PROGRAMS

This item was removed from the agenda.

XXVI. REPORT OF THE SUPERINTENDENT

There was no report of the Superintendent.

XXVI. COMMENTS BY STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEMBERS

A. Report of the State Board of Education Oversight Sub-Committee on Charter Schools - Mrs. Marianne Yared McGuire

Mrs. McGuire presented the report from the Charter School Oversight Committee, and said she feels it also responds to the reports regarding public school academies and the Board's leadership role of oversight and monitoring of charter schools. She thanked Mrs. Wise, Dr. Moyer, and Dr. Gary Wolfram for input and assistance in preparing the report of the Oversight Sub-Committee.

Dr. Michael Williamson, Assistant Superintendent, said the Michigan Association of Public School Academies (MAPSA) along with the authorizers have asked Dykema, Gossett PLLC to do an extensive study of the oversight issue. He said he thinks it would be appropriate to ask the executive director of MAPSA, and the representatives of the larger authorizers, to attend the March 18, 1999 meeting to discuss oversight issues with the Board.

In response to Mrs. McGuire, Dr. Williamson said the Dykema Gossett law firm has completed a thorough review of the statutory background for oversight and agency relationships. He said it may be beneficial for them to report to the Board on their findings and engage the Board in further discussion relating to this issue.

Dr. Williamson said the authorizers have been anticipating this report for some time and are prepared to respond to the Board's questions. He said they have asked their counsel to focus on this issue so they would be prepared to engage in discussion.

Mrs. McGuire moved, seconded by Mrs. Straus, that the State Board of Education (1) receive the report of the State Board of Education Oversight Sub-Committee on Charter Schools; and (2) transmit the report of the State Board of Education Oversight Sub-Committee on Charter Schools to the six largest public school academy authorizers for input and response prior to the State Board of Education meeting of March 18, 1999.

The vote was taken on the motion.

Ayes: Beardmore, Gire, McGuire, Straus, Weiser, Wise
Absent: Durant, Moyer

The motion carried.

- B. National Association of State Boards of Education - Mrs. Dorothy Beardmore

Mrs. Beardmore said the Board has been asked for nominations for the National Association of State Boards of Education (NASBE) officers. She said the Board is not eligible to nominate anyone from Michigan because a State Board of Education member already holds an office at NASBE.

Mrs. Straus moved, seconded by Mrs. McGuire, that the State Board of Education nominate Ms. Cleo Mathews, current Vice President of NASBE, for President of the National Association of State Boards of Education.

Mrs. Weiser said she was not comfortable nominating someone whom she knows nothing about.

Mrs. Eileen Hamilton, Administrative Secretary to the State Board of Education, said nominations could be made by individual Board members without Board approval.

Mrs. Straus withdrew her motion, Mrs. McGuire her support.

- C. Committee of the Whole Meeting Regarding Discussion of Strategic Planning- March 17, 1999 - Mrs. Dorothy Beardmore

Mrs. Beardmore said the Board agreed to allow Mr. Craig Ruff, President, Public Sector Consultants, Inc., to conduct a phone survey of each Board member and department directors regarding the update of the Action Plan. She said Mrs. Eileen Hamilton, Administrative Secretary to the State Board of Education, will contact each Board member to verify that they would be available for a Committee of the Whole meeting on the evening of March 17, 1999.

Dr. Michael Williamson, Assistant Superintendent, said Mr. Craig Ruff, President, Public Sector Consultants, Inc., has indicated that he would be available to meet with the Board on Wednesday, March 17, 1999 and/or the morning of March 18, 1999, if needed.

XXVII. TENTATIVE AGENDA FOR NEXT MEETING

- A. Approval of FY 1999-2000 Federal Application for *Early On*® Michigan Under Part C of the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act (IDEA)
- B. Approval of 1999-2000 Emergency Immigrant Education Program Application
- C. Approval of Criteria for 1998-99 Homeless Students' Assistance Grants
- D. Approval of the Grant Criteria for Development and Training for the Office of Field Services
- E. Approval of State Leadership Grants Under the Federal Eisenhower Professional Development Program
- F. Approval of FY 99 Special Project Grants for HIV Prevention, Expanded Programs and Building Infrastructure Funded by the Centers for Disease Control (CDC)
- G. Approval of Amendment to the Negotiated Grant Agreement with Eaton Intermediate School District as Approved by the State Board of Education on September 3, 1998
- H. Approval of Campus Social Mentoring Project to Reduce Underage Drinking
- I. Report on Proprietary Schools
- J. Receive the Report on Personnel Status
- K. Approval of Four 1998-2001 Intermediate School District Plans for the Delivery of Special Education Programs and Services
- L. Approval of Standards for the Social Studies (RX) Endorsement on a Michigan Teaching Certificate
- M. Approval of Authorization to Accept Administrative Experience for Advanced Teacher Certification
- N. Approval of Proposal from Calvin College for a New Health Program as a Minor at the Elementary and Secondary Levels
- O. Approval of Proposal from Oakland University for a New English Program

as

a Minor at the Secondary Level and an Amendment of its English Program as a Major at the Secondary Level

- P. Approval of Carl D. Perkins State Plan Transition to United States Department of Education, Including Allocations for 1999-2000
- Q. Approval of Financial Status of Michigan Deficit School Districts for 1997-98
- R. Approval of October - December 1998 Report of State Board of Education Expenses
- S. Appointment of Members to State Board of Education Advisory Groups
- T. Approval of Nominations to the Special Education Advisory Committee
- U. Approval of State Board of Education/Department of Education Cosponsorships
- V. Presentation of Achieve, Inc. Report
- W. Report of Hearing Officer
 - 1. Property Transfer Case C-2589 - Alan and Sally Colandrea
 - 2. Property Transfer Case C-2591 - Chris and Stephanie Carpenter
 - 3. Property Transfer Case C-2596 - Chris and Heather Ward
- X. Approval of the 2001-2002 Assessment Plans for MEAP Mathematics and Science
- Y. Approval of Policy Regarding the Certification Requirement of Teachers of Contracted Programs
- Z. Approval of Recommendations Regarding Administrative Rule Waivers

Mrs. Gire moved, seconded by Mrs. Straus, that the State Board of Education approve the tentative agenda for the next meeting.

Ayes: Beardmore, Gire, McGuire, Straus, Weiser, Wise
Absent: Durant, Moyer

The motion carried.

XXVIII. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 5:05 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Herbert S. Moyer
Secretary